

# A Content Analysis of Job Satisfier and Job Dissatisfier of Physical Education Teachers 香港體育教師對其工作所感到滿意和不滿意的地方—內容分析

Robert Siu Kuen NG

Physical Education Section,  
The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, HONG KONG

吳兆權

香港理工大學學生事務處體育部



## Abstract

This study was adopted open-ended questions to collect the views of Hong Kong Physical Education teachers regarding (1). their perception of aspects of their jobs that gave them most satisfaction and most dissatisfaction. (2). the suggestions to improve their working conditions. A content analysis of a total of 1,348 written comments found that student related matters and teaching related matters accounted for the source of most satisfying and most dissatisfying aspects of teaching physical education respectively.

Keywords: job satisfaction, physical education, teachers, job satisfier, job dissatisfier

## 摘要

本研究是採用開放式問題形式收集香港體育教師(1).對他們工作所感到滿意和不滿意的地方。(2).改善其工作環境的建議。在收集所得的 1,348 個建議中，內容分析結果顯示，香港體育教師感到非常滿意和不滿意的地方分別來自學生和教學上的事項。

## Introduction

In Hong Kong, the jobs of Physical Education (PE) teachers include teaching, coaching school teams, discipline, guidance, and the purchase and maintenance of PE equipment and facilities. The multiple roles of Hong Kong PE teachers create a unique role conflict (Ng, 2002). Research related to job satisfaction among PE teachers in Hong Kong is rare. Ng (1998) carried out a preliminary study in 1996 to investigate job satisfaction levels of Hong Kong PE teachers and their intention to leave PE and a teaching career. A similar study was conducted by Chan, Lau and Hui (2001) during the academic year from

1996-1997 to examine job satisfaction levels of Hong Kong PE teachers and their intention of staying in a PE career. More recently, Ng (in press) employed factor analysis to identify 13 subscales which construct the job satisfaction among 208 Hong Kong PE teachers. However, further research is needed to explore the sources of job satisfiers and dissatisfiers among PE teachers. The purpose of the present study is to find out the factors which contribute the job satisfaction and dissatisfaction of Hong Kong PE teachers. Open-ended questions were applied in the questionnaire so that respondents could express their own views.

## Method

**Population** - The population consisted of all PE full-time PE teachers of primary and secondary schools in Hong Kong. Teachers in private international schools and special schools were excluded from the sample population.

**Sample** - Schools were randomly selected as the primary sampling units. The sample for this study included 444 PE teachers from 444 schools which represented 246 primary schools and 198 secondary schools. If there was more than one PE teacher in a school, the principal was asked to distribute the questionnaire randomly to one of them.

## Data collection

**Instrumentation** - The study utilised a self-administered mailed questionnaire to obtain quantitative data regarding the job satisfaction of Hong Kong PE teachers. The mail survey method was selected in preference to other data collection methods in survey research like email, telephone, personal interviews, or a combination of these. According to Mertens (1998) and Gay (1996), mail surveys are effective for collecting detailed information in a closed format, the cost is relatively low, it requires less time, and permits collection of data from a much larger sample. Other advantages are lack of pressure on the respondent for an immediate response, anonymity for the respondent, and a reduction of interviewer bias. The latter two reasons are applicable to the conservative culture of the Chinese Hong Kong people (Birnbaum & Wong, 1985).

This study was part of a project to investigate the factors influencing the job satisfaction of Hong Kong PE teachers. The four page questionnaire consisted of three sections: a) one item overall job satisfaction level of PE teacher, b) a series of four open-ended questions and c) biographical information.

## Procedures

The questionnaire was mailed to the respondents' school addresses. Follow-up mailings 4 weeks after initial mailing prompted a response from 208 PE teachers, 122 from secondary and 86 from primary schools. These represented a 46.85 % response rate.

## Dependent variable

**Overall job satisfaction** - The degree of overall job satisfaction as a PE teacher was directly measured by a 6-point rating scale that ranged from 1 (highly dissatisfied) to 6 (highly satisfied).

The second section of the questionnaire solicited information regarding teachers' perceptions of aspects of their jobs that gave them most satisfaction and most dissatisfaction. Teachers were also asked for their views as to how the Hong Kong Education Department (HKED), the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR) government and/or their principal might improve working conditions as well as other recommendations to improve the job satisfaction of PE teachers. The teachers were asked to provide three responses to each of the four questions.

Biographical information was requested in the third section of the questionnaire, including personal and professional characteristics of the respondents. Based on previous questionnaires in the literature, this included marital status, chronological age, gender, number of dependents, job title, years of teaching experience, educational level, gender of their principals, school type, and location of school.

## Statistical Analysis

The open-ended comments were categorized and tested for sex differences by Chi square. Finally, the content analysis of the open-ended comments were employed.

## Result and Discussion

### Personal and Professional Characteristics of Respondents

PE teachers from secondary school constituted about three-fifth of the respondents (59.1 %). There were slightly more males (55.3 %) than females (44.7 %) and the majority of the respondents were aged between 26 and 45 years (78.4 %). Most of the respondents were married (60.6 %) and had two or more dependents residing at home (74.7 %). Half of the respondents (50.0 %) worked in the New Territories district. About half of the respondents (49.0 %) had between six and fifteen years of teaching experience. The respondents were predominantly university graduates (51.4 %) and more than one third (35.1 %) had a teacher's certificate. With regard to the job title of the respondents, the most common

categories were certificated master/mistress (39.9 %) and graduated master/mistress (21.2 %). Sixty-two % of respondents reported that the principal was male.

### **Overall Satisfaction Level**

88.5 % of the Hong Kong PE teachers stated that they were satisfied with their work.

### **Written Responses**

The overall response rate to the four open-ended questions was 68.8 %, with responses of 80.8 % (168/208), 78.8 % (164/208), 73.6 % (153/208), and 13.5 % (28/208) from open-ended questions one, two, three and four respectively. Each respondent was invited to identify up to three factors in each open-ended questions. In general, the frequency of responses decreased with the increasing question number, they are 462, 415, 443 and 28 written comments respectively. There were no significant difference for the percentage of men and women commented on open-ended question number one (chi square = .560,  $p = .454$ ), question number two (chi square = .012,  $p = .911$ ), question number three (chi square = .671,  $p = .413$ ), and question number four (chi square = .001,  $p = .977$ ). From the open-ended questions, all responses were included and retained as much of the teachers' original phraseology as possible. However, some comments were altered slightly, without distorting their meaning, in order to make them more readable.

### **Most Satisfying Aspects of Teaching Physical Education**

With a responses rate of 80.8 % a total of 462 written comments were provided by the respondents, which included 294 and 168 comments from teachers in secondary and primary schools, respectively. Sources of job satisfaction fell into five categories, namely: student related items, teaching related items, teaching items, occupational related items and working conditions (see Table 1). The most frequently mentioned category involved student related items (55.4 %). They included student enjoyment, student personal and social growth, student achievement, student-teacher relations, and student eagerness to join sports teams. Teaching related items, such as teaching PE as a personal interest, recognition and support from school and colleagues, good prospects and promotion opportunities, job security and good resources, accounted for approximately one quarter of responses (26.8 %). Occupational related items included family and parental support, society recognition, and mission and vision is clear (7.1 %). Working conditions

providing satisfaction included financial remuneration, no homework correction, no pressure from public examination, and sufficient holidays (3.7 %).

The PE teachers in the present study seem to be both activity-oriented and learning-oriented. This supports the views of Brunetti (2001) and Earls (1981), who interviewed PE teachers and found that the source of job satisfaction related to interactions with the students and their learning and growing. They also noted that student enjoyment and success as well as long term effects were important to the teachers.

Results also showed that the relationships with students were a primary source of teacher job satisfaction. Similar issues were identified by Diener (1985), Hutton and Jobe (1985), Shann (1998), Stenlund (1995), and Wright and Custer (1998) where a strong relationship between teacher satisfaction and student achievement was established. This also supports the view of Lortie (1975) that the structure of the teaching occupation favoured the importance of psychic (intrinsic) rather than material (extrinsic) rewards. Teachers turned to intrinsic sources of satisfaction, such as the enjoyment gained when interacting with students (Lortie, 1975; Taylor & Tashakkori, 1995). The level of job satisfaction perceived by teachers has also been shown to be linked to their perceptions of their students (Lobosco & Newman, 1992). High satisfaction was experienced as a result of student achievement (Diener, 1985). Lortie (1975) further maintained that rewards available to teachers were largely congruent with those they value - the intrinsic rewards that came from working with students and addressing students' needs.

**Table 1. Frequency and Percentage Frequency Distributions of Written Responses which Contributed to Overall Satisfaction in Teaching PE.**

Factors	Secondary school frequency	Primary school frequency	Frequency (percentage) (%)
<b>Student Related Items</b>			
Students like PE and enjoy the lesson	55	29	84 (18.2)
Intrinsic reward of the skill development of a child	43	26	69 (14.9)
Students' achievement	31	17	48 (10.4)
Good teacher and student relations	23	12	35 (7.6)
Less talented students to develop self-esteem by the assistance of their team-mates	7	4	11 (2.4)
Students eager to join the sports team	5	4	9 (1.9)
Sub-total	164	92	256 (55.4%)
<b>Teaching Related Items</b>			
Get paid to have fun	22	14	36 (7.8)
Support from co-operation among colleague	15	9	24 (5.2)
Support from school	10	12	22 (4.8)
Recognition of principal and supervisor	14	2	16 (3.5)
Good resources	7	8	15 (3.2)
Good promotion opportunity	7	0	7 (1.5)
Job security	2	1	3 (0.6)
Good prospect	1	0	1 (0.2)
Sub-total	78	46	124 (26.8%)
<b>Teaching Items</b>			
Freedom in professional autonomy	Sub-total 19	13	32 (6.9)
<b>Occupation Related Items</b>			
Support from students' parents	10	10	20 (4.3)
Professional recognition from society	8	2	10 (2.2)
Family support	1	0	1 (0.2)
Mission and vision of school is clear	1	1	2 (0.4)
Sub-total	20	13	33 (7.1%)
<b>Working Conditions Items</b>			
Good salary	9	2	11 (2.4)
No homework correction	3	1	4 (0.9)
Lots of vacation time	0	1	1 (0.2)
No pressure from public examination	1	0	1 (0.2)
Sub-total	13	4	17 (3.7%)
Total	294	168	462

Note : Respondents were invited to list up to three factors contributing most to their overall satisfaction in their work as PE teachers

## Most Dissatisfying Aspects of Teaching PE

Hong Kong PE teachers were dissatisfied with intrinsic, school-based as well as extrinsic societal such as school resources, student motivation, high workload, low status and recent imposed educational reform over which they have little control.

A total of 415 written comments were received representing 78.8 % response rate, which included 274 and 141 comments from teachers in secondary and primary schools respectively. Table 2 and Figure 2 show that teaching related aspects were the largest contributors to teacher dissatisfaction (37.6 %), including inadequate resources, lack of support from parents, colleagues and principal, poor teaching environment, unfair promotion opportunity, no prospects, unfair distribution of resource, and unclear of the mission and vision. Other sources of dissatisfaction were related to working conditions like class size, teaching load, demand on training and coaching school teams, lack of preparation time, excessive paperwork, inadequate number of PE teachers, unfair distribution of workload, and low salary (27.7 %). Student related items represented 17.1 %, including students' misbehaviour, lack of motivation, afraid of injury, lack of achievement, and students with mixed ability. Fifteen point nine % of the reported sources came from occupation-related items such as low status, energy exhaustion, too few lessons in the curriculum, lack of staff development, and risk of injury.

It is worth noting that the vast majority of comments regarding job dissatisfaction in teaching PE arose from teaching students with poor motivation and with low or mixed learning abilities. The results of the present study are similar to the findings of Stenlund (1995) in that students exhibiting low motivation appear to be a major contributor to teacher dissatisfaction across the seven nations he studied. This is consistent with the findings of a survey on Hong Kong teachers' job satisfaction in 2001 (Education Department, 2001) where only 56.2 % and 47.1 % of teachers from primary and secondary schools were satisfied or very satisfied with the overall behaviour of students. Teaching unmotivated or less able students poses a challenge for teachers and demands extra effort and time, while improvement in students may not be immediate. It is the responsibility of the PE teacher to teach all students to improve, for example, their fitness and overall health so they can lead an active lifestyle and minimize potential medical problems. It is especially important for the PE teacher to help less skilled and unfit students who need a structured fitness-based, skills-oriented PE experience to help change their attitudes and behaviour toward exercise, lifetime sports, and a heart-healthy lifestyle (Staffo, 1992).

Besides the factors relating to students, the other most frequent dissatisfaction responses pertained to scarcity of resources, low status and high workload. This reflects the working situation in Hong Kong, where teachers have to manage up to 40 students in a playground as well as heavy coaching duties and extra demands imposed by recent educational innovations and changes like the Target-Oriented Curriculum, School-Based Management, and Language Benchmark Assessments for teachers of English and Putonghua. In addition, there are the extra demands on them to provide support for newly arrived children from the Mainland. Although these changes may not have a direct impact on PE teachers, some may be affected if they are involved in the changes. These findings are closely related as Pollard (1982) and Goodson (1984) suggested that status in school reflects the bargaining power for the limited resources available in the school. It was consistent with studies of teacher satisfaction based on Maslow's (1970) hierarchy of needs theory which supported the connection between need-fulfilment and job satisfaction (Carver & Sergiovanni, 1971; Frances & Lebras, 1982; McCormick, 1997; Sweeney, 1981; Trusty & Sergiovanni, 1966). These authors cited an absence of the top stages in Maslow's (1970) hierarchy of basic needs, esteem, autonomy, and self-actualization, as a major contributor to teacher dissatisfaction. Similar findings reported by Dinham and Scott (2000) point out that these dissatisfiers are largely out of control of the teachers and schools.

The results in the present study reinforce the areas of dissatisfaction found among PE teachers by other investigators (Evans & Williams, 1989; Macdonald, 1995; Sparkes, 1992; Sparkes, Templin & Schempp, 1993; Stroot, Faucette & Schwager, 1993; Templin, 1989). These include the marginal status of PE teachers and their subject, lack of collegiality, work overload, insufficient resources, isolation, routinized nature of work, and lack of career mobility. In Hong Kong, PE teaching has long been plagued with problems of low status, inadequate facilities, and limited upward mobility (To, 1985). The same issue regarding resource constraints and large class sizes was raised by the Director of Education, Hong Kong SAR at an International Congress for School Effectiveness in 1999 (Law, 1999). The result also reinforces the findings in the Abridged Report of the Education Department (2001) that only 51.0 % and 57.3 % of teachers from primary and secondary schools were satisfied or very satisfied with the resources and facilities in their schools.

Interestingly, there was only one comment out of a total of 415 responses relating to 'low salary for teachers'. This finding is at variance with many studies where poor compensation is typically among the top three factors cited (Litt & Turk, 1985; Seyfarth & Bost, 1986). Compared to other professions, teaching has relatively little to offer in the way of external rewards. Since the pay scale of teachers is quite homogenous throughout the field, financial compensation differs little among teachers. Therefore, before entering the field they understand the salary structure and should have no illusion of expecting high financial rewards. The other possible explanation relates to Lawler's discrepancy theory (1971) where individuals compare their inputs and outputs from a job. Satisfaction with pay is dependent on actual pay in relation to the worker's perception of productivity of colleagues in similar positions. This observation supports the findings of Wright and Custer (1998) that certain intrinsic rewards such as esteem and autonomy offset perceived low salary and poor compensation and only become serious issues when intrinsic rewards are not present, or are greatly reduced.

Concerning the most frequently cited satisfaction and dissatisfaction comments (see Tables 1), it is interesting to note that they are related to the students in some way. This means the teachers' greatest satisfactions may also be their greatest dissatisfactions. Teaching is essentially a communication oriented activity, and the majority of a teacher's time involves teacher-student interactions. This supports the views of Plax (1986) that teacher satisfaction is a function of effective student management ability. Therefore, it is not surprising to find that student related factors are a significant and integral component of teachers' job satisfaction and dissatisfaction. One possible explanation is that teachers choose to remain in teaching for the satisfaction that comes from intrinsic rewards such

as student growth, learning and achievement as indicated in the job satisfiers in the open-ended question (see Table 1). However, there are students with negative behaviour and attitudes towards school as indicated in the job dissatisfiers in the open-ended question (see Table 2). Similar findings were observed in numerous other studies (Dedrick, Hawkes, Richard & Smith, 1981; Graham, West & Schaller, 1992; Greenberg, 1984; Kottkamp, Provenzo & Cohen, 1986; Litt & Turk, 1985; Lortie, 1975; McCaleb, 1984; Menlo & Poppleton, 1990; Rosenholtz, 1989; Sarason, 1982; Staffo, 1992; Wright & Custer, 1998). In these studies, teachers derived the most enjoyment from their students, while at the same time their students also provided their greatest frustrations.

Referring to job satisfiers and dissatisfiers in the open-ended questions (see Tables 1 and 2), it appears that the absence of the source of job satisfaction does not necessarily lead to job dissatisfaction. Such expressions of feelings about their work support the dual factor theory of Herzberg (1968). This finding is in agreement with the work of Herzberg and colleagues (1957) that the motivators, which refer to intrinsic aspects of teaching such as teachers' self-growth, personal development, and recognition, tend to promote job satisfaction. Hygiene factors, which relate to external aspects of work such as poor working conditions, tend to result in teachers' dissatisfaction (Bogler, 2001; Graham & Messner, 1998; Sergiovanni, 1967). Conversely, this observation is at variance with the traditional model of job satisfaction by Smith, Kendall and Hulin (1969) that any factor of job satisfaction can be both a satisfier and dissatisfier.

**Table 2. Frequency and Percentage Frequency Distributions of Written Responses which Contributed to Overall Dissatisfaction in Teaching PE.**

Factors	Secondary school frequency	Primary school frequency	Frequency (percentage) (%)
<b>Student Related Items</b>			
Student lacking motivation	38	18	56 (13.5)
Students misbehavior	6	1	7 (1.7)
Students afraid of injury	0	3	3 (0.7)
Lack of competition achievement by students	2	1	3 (0.7)
Students of mixed ability	1	1	2 (0.5)
Sub-total	47	24	71 (17.1%)



**Table 2. Frequency and Percentage Frequency Distributions of Written Responses which Contributed to Overall Dissatisfaction in Teaching PE. (Continued)**

Factors	Secondary school frequency	Primary school frequency	Frequency (percentage) (%)
<b>Teaching Related Items</b>			
Inadequate resource	29	26	55 (13.3)
Lack of cooperation from PE colleagues	29	5	34 (8.2)
Lack of cooperation from parents of students	14	14	28 (6.7)
Poor teaching environment	6	4	10 (2.4)
Lack of support from principal	8	2	10 (2.4)
Unfair promotion opportunity	8	2	10 (2.4)
No prospect	5	1	6 (1.4)
The mission and vision of the school is not clear	2	0	2 (0.5)
Unfair distribution of resource	0	1	1 (0.2)
Sub-total	101	55	156 (37.6%)
<b>Working Conditions Items</b>			
High demands on training and coaching school teams after school and during weekends	28	9	37 (8.9)
High teaching loads	25	10	35 (8.4)
Excessive paperwork	12	7	19 (4.6)
Large classes size (high student-teacher ratios)	9	8	17 (4.1)
Inadequate number of PE teachers	2	2	4 (1.0)
Unfair distribution of workload	1	0	1 (0.2)
Spend a lot of time on preparing other subject matters	0	1	1 (0.2)
Low salary	1	0	1 (0.2)
Sub-total	78	37	115 (27.7%)
<b>Occupation Related Items</b>			
Low status of the PE profession	25	14	39 (9.4)
Work outside, energy and spirit exhaustion	11	2	13 (3.1)
Too few lessons in the curriculum	4	3	7 (1.7)
Lack of staff development	2	3	5 (1.2)
Great risk of injury	1	1	2 (0.5)
Sub-total	43	23	66 (15.9%)
<b>Teaching Items</b>			
The content of the curriculum is boring	3	1	4 (1.0)
Bureaucracy	2	1	3 (0.7)
Sub-total	5	2	7 (1.7%)
Total	274	141	415

Note: Respondents were invited to list up to three factors contributing most to their overall dissatisfaction in their work as PE teachers

### Areas for the Hong Kong Education Department, the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Government, and Principals to Improve the Working Conditions of PE Teachers

A total of 232 suggestions were suggested for the HKED, which included 154 and 78 comments from secondary and primary schools respectively (see Table 3). Suggestions for reducing class sizes, ranging from 1 teacher to 20 pupils

and 1 teacher to 28 pupils were the main area for the HKED to improve the working conditions of PE teachers (22.4 %). Respondents recommended more in-service courses for PE teachers (22.0 %) and increased promotion opportunity (12.1 %). In the area of resources, respondents suggested more PE teachers (7.3 %) and reducing paperwork (10.8 %). The respondents also suggested reducing the total number of teaching periods (3.9 %), and providing overtime payments, and travelling allowances for coaching (3.0 %).

**Table 3. Frequency and Percentage Frequency Distributions of Written Responses for the Hong Kong Education Department to Improve the Working Conditions of PE Teachers.**

Areas for the Hong Kong Education Department to improve the working conditions of PE teachers	Secondary school	Primary school	Frequency (percentage)
<i>The Hong Kong Education Department</i>	frequency	frequency	(%)
Reduce the teacher and pupils ratio (suggestion: ranged from 1:20 to 1:28)	40	12	52 (22.4%)
Provide more staff development in-service courses	27	24	51 (22.0%)
Increase promotion opportunity	23	5	28 (12.1%)
Reduce paperwork	14	11	25 (10.8%)
Increase the number of PE teachers	10	7	17 (7.3%)
Change the curriculum to suit the needs of students	11	5	16 (6.9%)
Increase the total number of PE lessons in curriculum	7	6	13 (5.6%)
Reduce the total number of teaching periods	6	3	9 (3.9%)
Overtime payment and travelling allowance for coaching	7	0	7 (3.0%)
Establish PE teachers union	3	0	3 (1.3%)
Consultate the frontline PE teachers before changing policy	1	2	3 (1.3%)
Primary school should conduct in full day, as existing half-daysetting cannot carry out sports training after school in playground	0	3	3 (1.3%)
Provide curriculum content in detail	2	0	2 (0.9%)
The Director of Education Department should be having relevant teaching experience	2	0	2 (0.9%)
Understand the shortcoming and difficulties of school	1	0	1 (0.4%)
Total	154	78	232



Table 4 summarizes a total of 133 suggestions for the HKSAR government which represented 100 and 33 comments from secondary and primary schools respectively. The majority

of suggestions pertained to increased resources (59.4 %), improvement of the status of PE teachers (38.4 %), and more parental support (2.3 %).

**Table 4. Frequency and Percentage Frequency Distributions of Written Responses for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region to Improve the Working Conditions of PE Teachers.**

Areas for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region government to improve the working conditions of PE teachers	Secondary school	Primary school	Frequency
<i>The Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Government</i>	frequency	frequency	(%)
Provide more resources (facilities and equipment)	54	25	79 (59.4%)
Enhance the status of the PE profession in society	34	4	38 (28.6%)
Enhance the status of PE equal to the other academic subjects	10	3	13 (9.8%)
More support from parents of students	2	1	3 (2.3%)
Total	100	33	133

**Table 5. Frequency and Percentage Frequency Distributions of Written Responses for the Principals to Improve the Working Conditions of PE Teachers.**

Areas for their principals to improve the working conditions of PE teachers	Secondary school	Primary school	Frequency (percentage)
<i>Their Principals</i>	frequency	frequency	(%)
More support from school	17	3	20 (25.6)
More recognition from principal	12	4	16 (20.5)
Time spent on training and coaching sports teams should take into account of workload	12	0	12 (15.4)
PE teachers are not all round so that we should employ coaches to let students wholly development	9	0	9 (11.5)
Fair distribution of workload	7	1	8 (10.3)
Encourage more teachers to coach or lead school teams	2	1	3 (3.8)
Health education and promotion via PE lessons	1	2	3 (3.8)
Provide independent teachers room	2	0	2 (2.6)
School provide good climate for students to participate sports activities	2	0	2 (2.6)
Increase the total area of teachers room	1	0	1 (1.3)
Organize sports activities to suit different level students in all districts	1	0	1 (1.3)
Provide teachers rest room	1	0	1 (1.3)
Total	67	11	78

Table 6 shows the other recommendations provided by the respondents for improving job satisfaction among PE teachers. With a response rate of 13.5 %, 15 secondary and 13 primary teachers listed a total of 28 suggestions. The respondents

recommended workload reduction by not being class teachers and sharing the workload of organizing sports activities like sports day and swimming gala with other teachers.

**Table 6. Frequency and Percentage Frequency Distributions of Written Responses for Other Recommendations to Improve Job Satisfaction of PE Teachers.**

Other recommendations to improve job satisfaction of PE teachers	Secondary School Frequency	Primary School Frequency	Frequency (percentage) (%)
Reduce the workload of PE teacher by excluding be class teachers	6	2	8 (28.6)
Exchange programmes and competitions for PE teachers to share their teaching experiences	4	4	8 (28.6)
Emphasize on student achievement	2	6	8 (28.6)
The organization work of sports day and swimming gala should not mainly rely on PE teachers	1	0	1 (3.6)
PE teachers have their compensatory leave during school examination period	1	0	1 (3.6)
Career insurance for PE teachers	1	0	1 (3.6)
Produce detailed teaching material by the Hong Kong Institute of Education to illustrate each unit in the PE curriculum	0	1	1 (3.6)
Total	15	13	28

The majority of the suggestions for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, Education Department and school principals can be summarized in five broad categories: (1) provide more resources, (2) enhance the status of the PE profession, (3) reduce class size and workload, (4) provide more recognition and (5) provide more support and staff-development training like in-service training courses. These suggestions are in line with the comments regarding job dissatisfaction that were given in open-ended questions (see Table 2). As Lortie (1975) described it, teaching is unstaged and front loaded; that is, teachers know what they will earn and long service brings limited salary increases. Financial compensation for teachers tends to be tightly tied to seniority. Special performance or merit is not recognized through financial reward. To give special recognition to the contribution of teachers, the Chief Executive of the Hong Kong SAR declared 10<sup>th</sup> September each year to be 'Teachers Day'. It is also an annual reminder to teachers of their immense responsibility towards children who will shape the future of Hong Kong. Various community organizations in collaboration with the Hong Kong Education Department have devised reward schemes to give recognition to outstanding teachers. These schemes have been well received and have helped to motivate teachers and propagate good teaching practices. There is scope for more rewards of a similar nature.

It is worth noting that staff development constitutes a major dimension of job satisfaction. This observation is consistent with the findings of Wisniewski (1990) that the needs for individual growth and consequent job satisfaction might be met through the process of job enrichment. In Hong Kong, principals have identified the need for more in-service PE courses (To, 1985). The Hong Kong Education Commission Report number seven (Education Commission, 1996) further affirmed the important role of the school in teacher development. Additional support comes from the findings of job satisfaction studies in other countries (Ball & Stenlund, 1990; Chandler, Lane, Bibik & Oliver, 1988; Dinham & Scott, 2000), which found that more in-service and continuing education of teachers at all levels in the career ladder was needed.

Special attention is drawn to comments about the low status of the PE profession. Since PE is a practical subject which does not affect the overall results of examination and advancement of the pupil, it is not surprising to note that PE status is low. The marginal status of PE teachers has also been detected in England (Lawson & Stroot, 1993), United States (Sparkes, Templin & Schempp, 1993), Australia (Macdonald, 1995), Canada (Ball & Stenlund, 1990) and Hong Kong (Johns & Dimmock, 1999). Dinham and Scott (2000) further supported this observation regarding the low status of PE teachers in

England, New Zealand and Australia. The comparison of the cultural element of different countries influencing their status will not be investigated in the present study. It is an area to explore this issue in future. It would appear that, in relation to professional status, Hong Kong PE teachers are no different to those in many other countries.

Griffey (1987) considered that few people cared about high school PE and PE status was low as the subject mainly involves teaching skills. Evans and Williams (1989), Macdonald (1995), Sparkes, Templin and Schempp (1990), and Schempp and Graber (1992) identified similar issues where lack of academic parity was the reason for low status. Cruz (1998) offered an explanation for the low status of PE in Hong Kong, stating that most senior form students start to prepare for their Hong Kong Certificate Examination in Grade Secondary Four. Practical subjects like physical education will be sacrificed if they are not involved in public examination. The Hong Kong Sports Development Board (1993) criticized secondary schools for not achieving the target of two PE periods per class as recommended by the Hong Kong Education Department. Mitchell and Earls (1987) suggested that the amount of time and resources allocated to PE reflect the status of PE within schools. Morris (1997) analyzed the Hong Kong secondary school curriculum and identified that the distribution of time to practical subjects such as PE, art, home economics and music in Hong Kong secondary schools is sacrificed.

Sparkes and Templin (1992) stated that advancement through teaching is unequal, due to the varying academic status and professional resources possessed by different teachers and their subjects. In order to enhance the status of PE, Sparkes (1992) and Stroot (1994) recommended showing outcomes, demonstrating the contribution of PE to the school curriculum. There exists a need to make the public aware of how PE can equip students for the coming challenges of society. This includes increasing self-esteem, promoting fitness, developing good citizenship, and fostering mastery and cooperation (Papaloannou & MacDonald, 1993). Johns and Dimmock (1999) suggested a number of strategies for addressing the marginalization of PE in the Hong Kong school curriculum such as curriculum integration and increase resource allocation. The Hong Kong PE Teachers Association was established in June 2000 to co-ordinate PE teachers and makes the public aware of the importance of physical education so as to enhance the status of PE teachers. The data collected in the open-ended questions support the view that the extent to which personal needs and values are perceived to be satisfied is the key constituent of job satisfaction.

## Conclusion

The sources of job satisfaction came from intrinsic aspects of their job which correspond to Maslow's (1970) higher order needs. The job dissatisfiers in responses to the open-ended question came from intrinsic, school-based, as well as extrinsic societal such as school resources, student motivation, high workload, low status and recent imposed educational reform over which the Hong Kong PE teachers have little control. This finding demonstrated that motivators (intrinsic factors) and hygiene factors (extrinsic factors) could be sources of job dissatisfaction, but that motivators were stronger.

The findings in the open-ended questions also suggested that PE teachers were dissatisfied with heavy workload, low status, lack of parental support and scarcity of resources. This is not something that teachers can remedy themselves. More personal and professional support from parents, colleagues and principals are needed. The Hong Kong Education Department can provide more resources like additional teachers or teaching assistants to reduce workload and class size. School principals can relocate resources and workload distribution. Increased out-sourcing of coaching work can ensure qualified coaches train school teams and reduce PE teachers' workload.

## References

- Ball, C. J., & Stenlund, V. (1990). The centrality of work, working conditions and job satisfaction of teachers in Canada: An Ontario study. *Comparative Education*, 26 (2-3), 319-330.
- Birnbaum, P. H., & Wong, G. Y. Y. (1985). Organizational structure of multinational banks in Hong Kong from a culture-free perspective. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 30(2), June, 262-277.
- Bogler, R. (2001). The influence of leadership style on teacher job satisfaction. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 37(5), 662-683.
- Brunetti, G. J. (2001). Why do they teach? A study of job satisfaction among long-term high school teachers. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 28(3), 49-74.
- Carver, F. D., & Sergiovanni, T. J. (1971). Complexity, adaptability, and job satisfaction in high schools: An axiomatic theory applied. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 9(1), 10-31.

- Chan, R. C. M., Lau, Y. H., & Hui, S. C. (2001). An evaluation of job satisfaction of physical education teachers in Hong Kong. *International Sports Journal*, 5(1), 60-70.
- Chandler, T. J. L., Lane, S. L., Bibik, J. M., & Oliver, B. (1988). The career ladder and lattice: A new look at the teaching career. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education*, 7, 132-141.
- Cruz, A. (1998). Senior female secondary school students' attitude towards physical education in Hong Kong. *Journal of Physical Education and Recreation (Hong Kong)*, 4 (1), 8-16.
- Dedrick, C. V., Hawkes, S., Richard, R., & Smith, J. K. (1981). Teacher stress: A descriptive study of the census. *NASSP Bulletin*, 65(445), 31-35.
- Diener, T. (1985). Community college faculty job satisfaction. *Community/Junior College Quarterly of Research and Practice*, 9, 347-357.
- Dinham, S., & Scott, C. (2000). Moving into the third, outer domain of teacher satisfaction. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 38(4), 379-396.
- Earls, N. F. (1981). Distinctive teachers' personal qualities, perceptions of teacher education and the realities of teaching. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education*, 1(1), 59-70.
- Education Commission (1996). *Report No. 7: Quality school education*. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Education Department (2001). *Abridged Report - Education Indicators for the Hong Kong School Education System*. Education Department, Hong Kong: Author.
- Evans, J., & Williams, T. (1989). Moving up and getting out: The classed, gendered career opportunities of physical education teachers. In T. Templin & P. Schempp (ed.), *Socialization in Physical Education: Learning to Teach* (pp.235-250). Indianapolis, IN: Benchmark Press.
- Frances, R., & Lebras, C. (1982). The prediction of job satisfaction. *International Review of Applied Psychology*, 31, 391-410.
- Gay, L. R. (1996). *Educational Research: Competencies for Analysis and Application* (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). Toronto: Merrill.
- Goodson, I. (1984). Beyond the subject monolith: Subject traditions and sub-cultures. In P. Harling (ed.), *New Directions in Educational Leadership* (pp.325-341). London: Falmer Press.
- Graham, E. E., West, R., & Schaller, K. A. (1992). The association between the relational teaching approach and teacher job satisfaction. *Communication Reports*, 5(1), Winter, 11-22.
- Graham, M. W., & Messner, P. E. (1998). Principals and job satisfaction. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 12(5), 196-202.
- Greenberg, S. F. (1984). *Stress and the Teaching Profession*. Baltimore, MD: Brookes.
- Griffey, D. C. (1987). Trouble for sure, a crisis - perhaps: Secondary school physical education today. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation and Dance*, 58(2), 20-21.
- Herzberg, F. (1968). One more time: How do you motivate employees? In M. M. Gruneberg (1976). *Job Satisfaction - A Reader* (1<sup>st</sup> ed., pp.17-32). London: Macmillan Press.
- Herzberg, F., Mausner, B. Peterson, R., & Capwell, D. (1957). *Job Attitudes: Review of Research and Opinion*. Pittsburgh: Psychological service of Pittsburgh.
- Hong Kong Sports Development Board. (1993). *Sport in Schools: The Future Challenge: A Seminar for School Principals*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Sports Development Board.
- Hutton, J. B., & Jobe, M. E. (1985). Job satisfaction of community college faculty. *Community/Junior College Quarterly of Research and Practice*, 9(4), 317-324.
- Johns, D. P., & Dimmock, C. (1999). The marginalization of physical education: improvement curriculum policy and practice in Hong Kong. *Journal of Education Policy*, 14(4), 363-384.
- Kottkamp, R. B., Provenzo, E. F., & Cohen, M. M. (1986). Stability and change in a profession: Two decades of teacher attitudes, 1964 - 1984. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 67 (8), 559-567.

- Law, F. C. F. (1999). *International Congress for School Effectiveness and Improvement Plenary Session on January 5, 1999 at 4pm - In Pursuit of Excellence: Challenges and Changes for the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region*. Hong Kong Special Administrative Region: Department of Education.
- Lawler, E. E. III (1971). *Pay and Organizational Effectiveness: A Psychological View*. New York: McGraw Hill.
- Lawson, H., & Stroot, S. (1993). Footprints and signposts: Perspectives of socialization research. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education*, 12, 437-446.
- Litt, M. D., & Turk, D. C. (1985). Sources of stress and dissatisfaction in experienced high school teachers. *Journal of Educational Research*, 78(3) January, 178-185.
- Lobosco, A. F., & Newman, D. L. (1992). Teaching special needs populations and teacher job satisfaction: Implications for teacher education and staff development. *Urban Education*, 27(1), 21-31.
- Lortie, D. C. (1975). *Schoolteacher - A Sociological Study*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Macdonald, D. (1995). The role of proletarianization in physical education teacher attrition. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*, 66(2), 129-141.
- Maslow, A. H. (1970). *Motivation and Personality*. New York: Harper and Row.
- McCaleb, J. (1984). Selecting a measure of oral communication as a predictor of teaching performance. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 35, 33-38.
- McCormick, J. (1997). An attribution model of teachers' occupational stress and job satisfaction in a large educational system. *Work and Stress*, 11(1), January, 17-32.
- Menlo, A., & Poppleton, P. (1990). A five country study of work perceptions of secondary school teachers in England, USA, Japan, Singapore, and West Germany. *Comparative Education*, 26, 173-180.
- Mertens, D. M. (1998). *Research Methods in Education and Psychology: Integrating Diversity with Quantitative & Qualitative Approaches*. London: Sage publications.
- Mitchell, M. F., & Earls, R. F. (1987). *A Priori Physical Education or a Priority? Proceedings of the Fifth Conference on Curriculum Theory in Physical Education*. Athens GA: University of Georgia.
- Morris, P. (1997). School knowledge, the state and the market: An analysis of the Hong Kong secondary school curriculum. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 29(3), 329-349.
- Ng, S. K. R. (1998). A profile of job satisfaction among physical education teachers in Hong Kong and their intention to change jobs. *Journal of Physical Education and Recreation (Hong Kong)*, 4(1), 29 - 41.
- Ng, S. K. R. (2002). A discussion on the role conflict between Hong Kong physical education teachers and coaches. *Journal of Physical Education and Recreation (Hong Kong)*, 8(1), 59 - 63.
- Ng, S. K. R. (in press). A factor analysis of job satisfaction among Hong Kong physical education teachers. *Journal of Physical Education and Recreation (Hong Kong)*.
- Papaloannou, A., & MacDonald A. I. (1993). Goal perspectives and purposes of physical education as perceived by Greek adolescents. *Physical Education Review*, 16, 41-48.
- Plax, T. G. (1986). Communicating control in the classroom and satisfaction with teaching and students. *Communication Education*, 35, 379-388.
- Pollard, A. (1982). A model of classroom coping strategies. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 3, 19-37.
- Rosenholtz, S. J. (1989). Workplace conditions that affect teacher quality and commitment: Implications for teacher induction programs. *The Elementary School Journal*, 89, 421-439.
- Sarason, S. B. (1982). *The Culture of the School and the Problem of Change* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Schempp, P., & Graber, K. (1992). Teacher socialization from a dialectical perspective: Pretraining through induction. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education*, 11, 329-348.
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (1967). Factors which affect satisfaction and dissatisfaction of teachers. *The Journal of Education Administration*, 5(1), 66-82.

- Seyfarth, J. T., & Bost, W. A. (1986). Teacher turnover and the quality of worklife in school: An empirical study. *Journal of Research and Development in Education*, 20(1), 1-6.
- Shann, M. H. (1998). Professional commitment and satisfaction among teachers in urban middle schools. *Journal of Educational Research*, 92(2), Nov/Dec: 67-77.
- Smith, P. C., Kendall, L. M., & Hulin, C. L. (1969). *The Measurement of Satisfaction in Work and Retirement*. Chicago: Rand McNally.
- Sparkes, A. C. (1992). Exploring the subjective dimension of curriculum change. In A. C. Sparkes (ed.), *Research in Physical Education and Sport: Exploring Alternative Visions* (pp.20-35). London: Falmer Press.
- Sparkes, A. C., & Templin, T. J. (1992). Life histories and physical education teachers: Exploring the meanings of marginality. In A. C. Sparkes (ed.), *Research in Physical Education and Sport: Exploring Alternative Visions* (pp. 118-145). London: Falmer Press.
- Sparkes, A., Templin, T. J., & Schempp, P. (1990). The problematic nature of a career in a marginal subject: Some implications for teacher education programmes. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 16(1), 3-28.
- Sparkes, A., Templin, T. J., & Schempp, P. (1993). Exploring dimensions of marginality: Reflecting on the life histories of physical education teachers. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education*, 12, 386-398.
- Staffo, D. F. (1992). Clarifying physical education teacher-coach responsibilities: A self-analysis guide for those in dual roles. *The Physical Educator*, 49(4), 52-56.
- Stenlund, K. V. (1995). Teacher perceptions across cultures: the impact of students on teacher enthusiasm and discouragement in a cross-cultural context. *The Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, 41(2), June, 145-161.
- Stroot, S. A. (1994). Contemporary crisis or emerging reform? A review of secondary school physical education. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education*, 13(4), July, 333-341.
- Stroot, S., Faucette, N., & Schwager, S. (1993). In the beginning: The induction of physical educators. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education*, 12, 375-385.
- Sweeney, J. (1981). Teacher dissatisfaction on the rise: Higher-level needs unfulfilled. *Education*, 102, 203-207.
- Taylor, D. L., & Tashakkori, A. (1995). Decision participation and school climate as predictors of job satisfaction and teachers' sense of efficacy. *Journal of Experimental Education*, 63(3), 217-230.
- Templin, T. J. (1989). Running on ice: A case study of the influence of workplace conditions on a secondary school physical educator. In T. Templin & P. Schempp (ed.), *Socialization in Physical Education: Learning to Teach* (pp.165-198). Indianapolis, IN: Benchmark Press.
- To, C. Y. (1985). *Physical Fitness of Children in Hong Kong. The Cooperative Cross-disciplinary Research Project on Physical Activities and Quality of Life in Densely Populated Urban Areas: Phase One Study Report*. Hong Kong: Chinese University of Hong Kong, School of Education.
- Trusty, F. M., & Sergiovanni, T. J. (1966). Perceived need deficiencies of teachers and administrators: A proposal for restructuring teacher roles. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 2, 168-180.
- Wisniewski, W. (1990). The job satisfaction of teachers in Poland. *Comparative Education*, 26(2-3), 299-306.
- Wright, M., & Custer, R. (1998). Why they enjoy teaching: The motivation of outstanding technology teachers. *Journal of Technology Education*, 9(2), Spring, 60-77.

### Correspondence:

Author: Ng Siu Kuen, Robert, PhD  
 Affiliation: Physical Education Section, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, HONG KONG  
 Address: 11 Yuk Choi Road, Hung Hom, Kowloon, Hong Kong  
 E-mail: sarobert@inet.polyu.edu.hk